INTEGRATED ENVIRONMENT AND HEALTH SURVEILLANCE: A systematic realist review

Alexandra Sawatzky1, Ashlee Cunsolo2, Andria Jones-Bitton1, Jacqueline Middleton1, and Sherilee L. Harper1

1) Department of Population Medicine, University of Guelph; 2) Labrador Institute of Memorial University

Introduction

Arctic and Subarctic regions across the Circumpolar North are experiencing some of the most drastic and rapid environmental changes in the world, resulting from stressors such as climate change and resource development.1-3 These changes are creating new, unprecedented challenges for the health of Northern populations.2,4 Integrated surveillance strategies that are designed to consider the range of potential interactions between environmental changes and human health within dynamic cultural, social, economic, and political contexts can help generate data, monitor trends, and identify opportunities for public health responses.4 However, few studies have synthesized information from peer-reviewed literature about integrated surveillance strategies for Arctic and Subarctic regions.

First Objective

Provide an overview of the range, extent, and distribution of integrated surveillance strategies in the Arctic and Subarctic outlined in the peer-reviewed literature.

Second Objective

Compare, contrast, and characterize the key components of integrated surveillance development, implementation, and uses that are described in the peer-reviewed literature.

Characteristics of Included Articles

Number of Articles
- 4,040 hits from database searches; 621 duplicates removed
- 3,419 titles and abstracts screened; of which 476 were deemed relevant
- 476 full texts reviewed; of which 73 met all of the inclusion criteria
- 12 additional relevant articles retrieved from hand searches
- 85 total articles included for data extraction, analysis, and synthesis

Topics
65% of articles were primary or secondary studies that served to inform and/or recommend integrated surveillance strategies (n=55). These studies contributed to a variety of different areas of environment and health research, including:

- Health and/or environmental impact assessments (n=30)
- Identifying indicators and threshold levels of risk (n=18)
- Climate change adaptation strategies (n=19)
- Environmental health surveillance (n=14)
- Wildlife health and harvesting (n=13)
- Food and water security (n=11)

The remaining 35% of articles were primary studies that dealt directly with the development, implementation, and/or application of integrated surveillance strategies (n=30). The strategies described in these studies focused on monitoring and responding to a variety of environmental and health concerns, including:

- Climate change impacts on health outcomes (n=6)
- Environmental contaminants (n=6)

Components of Integrated Surveillance

The components of integrated surveillance discussed in included articles fell into three main categories:

1) Structural components described the logistical, organizational, and operational components of integrated surveillance strategies.

2) Processual components described the approaches and methods used within integrated surveillance strategies.

3) Relational components described the interpersonal elements and sustained connections between stakeholders.

Integrated surveillance strategies operated at local, regional, national, and international levels and used various types and combinations of structural, processual, and relational components to work towards certain priorities.

Studies that described a greater total number of total components of integrated surveillance were more likely to describe components from across all three categories.

Data Extraction, Analysis, and Synthesis

- Created data extraction forms to gather descriptive information from included articles
- Uploaded articles into NVivo® online software to remove duplicates and facilitate screening
- Two independent reviewers screened titles and abstracts, and subsequently conducted full text reviews to select relevant articles based on inclusion and exclusion criteria

Selecting Studies and Assessing Relevance

- Established inclusion and exclusion criteria
- Uploaded articles into NVivo® online software, to facilitate thematic analysis, consisting of a comprehensive process of deductive and inductive coding5 11

Methods

This modified systematic realist review (SRR) applied the transparent, replicable methods of a systematic review to search for and identify relevant peer-reviewed literature,6 8 and drew upon realist review methods to synthesize and analyze the included studies.13

Searching the Literature

- Used a search string to conduct searches in MEDLINE® and Web of Science™ aggregator databases
- Hand-searched three key journals: Arctic; Environmental Health Perspectives; and International Journal of Circumpolar Health

Discussion

The literature indicated that environmental change cannot be adequately responded to in the North without involving numerous sources of information, focusing on multiple stressors and geographic coverage, and incorporating different knowledge systems, to produce real-time, usable environment and health surveillance data that can inform public health research, policy, programming, and decision-making.12

Based on the literature, one type of strategy does not fit all types of problems: examining the components of integrated surveillance strategies can help to understand how and why certain strategies can be structured to be more responsive to public health concerns within rapidly changing Northern environments.14 15

First Implication

An overview of the range and distribution of integrated surveillance strategies across different disciplines and scales can help public health research and practice understand how to use similar tools with different lenses, to address complex environment and health issues in the North.

Second Implication

The diversity of integrated surveillance strategies identified in the literature demonstrates that not all strategies can or should include the same types and combinations of components. Understanding how integrated surveillance strategies are structured to achieve certain priorities can support public health researchers and practitioners in decision-making about how, and in what combinations, to use structural, processual, and relational components to design and evaluate appropriate strategies for addressing environment and health concerns of Northern populations.

Acknowledgements

We would like to acknowledge Sahar Faramarz for her contributions to developing the research questions as well as her input in early discussions and searches. A special thanks to Isaac O’Donoghue and Jennifer Tatarnic for their comments, feedback, and guidance on this review.

Contact Information

Alex Sawatzky, PhD Candidate, Public Health, University of Guelph
Email: alexsawatzky@uoguelph.ca

References